

**Corporate & Scrutiny Management Policy & Scrutiny  
Committee**

**13 July 2015**

Report of the Assistant Director of Governance & ICT

**Draft Annual Scrutiny Report 2014-15**

**Summary**

1. This Draft Annual Scrutiny Report summarises the work of the five Overview & Scrutiny Committees for the municipal year June 2014 – May 2015, and asks Members to agree the report prior to its presentation to Council in July 2015.

**Background**

2. This committee is charged with monitoring overall performance in relation to scrutiny review work and providing an Annual Report to Full Council. The last Annual Report for the period June 2013 – May 2014 was presented to this Committee in May 2014 and to Council in July 2014.

**Consultation**

3. Consultation was not required for the production of this Annual Report. However, consultation is an important element of Overview & Scrutiny and is regularly carried out in support of all scrutiny reviews.
4. The final reports produced for each of the reviews completed during the period June 2014 – May 2015 detail all of the work undertaken, including any consultation carried out. Those final reports and all supporting information can be viewed in full at:

<http://modgov.york.gov.uk/ecCatDisplay.aspx?sch=doc&cat=13029&path=13028>

**Options**

5. Having considered the draft Annual Report, Members may choose to:
  - Agree any amendments required to the report

- Approve the report for presentation to the meeting of Full Council in July 2015.

## **Scrutiny Reviews in 2014-15**

6. Corporate Scrutiny Review  
In June 2014, Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee expressed an interest in carrying out a corporate scrutiny review during the 2014-15 municipal year to which each of the Overview & Scrutiny Committees could contribute.
7. The Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee agreed that the theme of the Corporate Review should be around Supporting Older People.
8. Having considered possible topics a number of the scrutiny committees agreed not to contribute as they were either unable to identify a suitable topic or they had insufficient time to complete a review before the start of the purdah period based on their already busy workplans. As a consequence CSMC agreed to abandon the 2014-15 Corporate Review.
9. Other Scrutiny Reviews:  
The following scrutiny review was carried out by the Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee in the last municipal year:
  - Equalities Review  
In November 2013 CSMC agreed to proceed with a review to raise awareness of the democratic process amongst York's Communities of Identity, and identify any required equalities training for Members. A Task Group was set up and as part of the review a consultation event was held at the Mansion House to meet with representatives from York's Communities of Identity to raise awareness of the democratic process, ways of getting involved, and to identify any barriers preventing their community engagement/involvement. The recommendations arising from the review were endorsed by CSMC in November 2014 and approved by Cabinet in early January 2015.
10. The Economic & City Development Overview & Scrutiny Committee completed two scrutiny reviews in 2014-15:
  - Online Business / E-Commerce Scrutiny Review  
Started in the previous municipal year, the Committee concluded its work to identify how CYC may better support city businesses to develop their online opportunities and improve their sales, marketing and profitability. To identify any gaps in this support an online survey

was launched asking businesses for feedback and the Task Group also received information on how other towns and cities are supporting the development of online business opportunities. The Task Group held a series of pop-up business cafe events to further identify gaps in support, examined funding opportunities and met with business and trader organisations. The recommendations in the final report were endorsed by ECDOSC in March 2015 and presented and approved by the Executive in June 2015.

- Graduate Business Start-Ups, Entrepreneurialism and Higher Value Jobs Scrutiny Review

At the beginning of the 2014-15 municipal year the Committee agreed to proceed with a review around identifying cost effective ways to attract graduates and entrepreneurs to start up or relocate in York thus enabling the employment of local people at higher than average wages. A Task Group was appointed, and to gather evidence they visited the University of York and York St John University as well as considering best practices from other local authorities and investigating the support available through Higher York and Science City York. The Task Group also met entrepreneurs who had established businesses in the city. The review final report was endorsed by ECDOSC in January 2015 and in early March 2015 Cabinet agreed to note the recommendations and pursue these as part of the work streams for Make it York and the Economic Strategy.

- Proposed Review of the Lendal Bridge Trial

The Economic & City Development Committee twice discussed proposals for a scrutiny review of the Lendal Bridge Trial. In June 2014 the Committee agreed not to proceed on the grounds that such a review would not add value and could be used as a forum for attributing blame. Later, in November 2014 the Committee voted not to proceed as it was felt that a review would not be objective.

11. The Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee carried out one review during 2014-15:

- Supporting Older People Scrutiny Review

Despite the decision by CSMC to abandon the Corporate Review around Supporting Older People, the Committee agreed to progress with a standalone review. After a series of delays and a change of Committee Chair, a Task Group was set up in November 2014 to establish what City of York Council is doing to assist older people. They met with the Vale of York Clinical Commissioning Group and representatives from voluntary organisations to examine how the work

of health workers in the community could be complemented by the voluntary sector with the aim of reducing hospital admissions and enabling older people to live independently for longer. The work on this review is ongoing and is likely to conclude in late 2015.

#### Proposed Review of NHS Underfunding & Efficiency Savings

In January 2014 the Committee considered a feasibility report arising from a resolution agreed by Full Council to consider a review of the impact on local health services, based on so called 'efficiency' savings and chronic underfunding of the NHS in York. The intention of the review was to enable residents to understand what future services would look like over the period 2015-2020.

Having been informed that Parliament was conducting an examination of the funding arrangements, and recognising the subject was politically charged, the Committee took account of the limited time available to conduct the review before the purdah period began, and chose not to carry out the review at that time.

12. In 2014-15 the Community Safety Overview & Scrutiny Committee concluded two reviews carried over from previous years:

- Domestic Waste Recycling Scrutiny Review

In July 2012, a Task Group was set up to look at ways of increasing domestic waste recycling. Having carried out an analysis of the recycling rates for the 20 top performing Local Authorities in order to identify best practice, the Task Group agreed to focus their review on the Council's 2013-14 'Recycle More' initiative, initiating test and control areas to gather evidence on the effectiveness of and the benefits arising from the Council's initiatives employed to improve kerbside recycling and reduce the amount of waste sent to landfill. This led to delays in the review whilst the work on those initiatives took place and the comparison work was undertaken. The Task Group's final report was endorsed by the Committee in September 2014 and the recommendations were approved by Cabinet in October 2014.

- A-Boards Scrutiny Review

Work continued on this review throughout 2014-15. Having considered all of the options and combinations of options available to the city regarding the appropriate use of A-boards, the Task Group recommended the introduction of a policy allowing the use of A-boards under strict criteria. They suggested the policy should include a list of streets where the use of A-boards is prohibited at all times due to the limited widths of footways, and that appropriate resources should be identified to ensure the full and proper enforcement of the new policy.

In January 2015 the Committee endorsed the Task Group's views and agreed a further recommendation that the new policy should be trialled for a two year period. In February 2015 Cabinet instructed the Director of City and Environmental Services to prepare guidelines for the use of A-boards across the city, for consideration at a future meeting, and to date this remains outstanding.

- Discretionary Charges in Waste Management Scrutiny Review  
The Community Safety Overview & Scrutiny Committee considered carrying out a further review during 2014-15. The intention was to review Discretionary Charges in Waste Management. In July 2014 the Committee received a scoping report which provided an introduction to the topic, which presented some initial information on a number of charging schemes in operation nationally, and suggested a number of other service areas that could be included in a review of charging policy. The Committee agreed to proceed with the review in order to identify possible savings that could be fed into the budget planning process. A Task Group was set up and its first meeting was scheduled to take place in October 2014, but this was later postponed following a change to the membership of the Committee. In November 2015 the Committee reconsidered the topic realising it would not be possible to complete the review within the required timescale to allow its recommendations to feed into the budget planning process. As a result, they agreed not to proceed and the review was abandoned.

13. The Learning & Culture Overview & Scrutiny Committee completed three reviews during 2014-15:

- Disabled Access to York's Heritage and Cultural Offer Scrutiny Review.  
In June 2014 the Committee agreed to review disabled access to York's heritage and cultural offer, and set up a Task Group to carry out this work. Current access to York's many heritage and cultural venues was assessed and the Task Group considered best practice in relation to cinemas and theatres; live music venues and tourist attractions. Members also considered Planning Guidance on Disabled Access to Historic Buildings and took into account the views of English Heritage. The Task group consulted with representatives from various groups and interested individuals, and in November 2014 the Task Group met with Visit York to gather their views. In February 2015 the full Committee endorsed the Task Group's recommendations and the final report was presented and the recommendations agreed by the Executive in June 2015.

- Entrepreneurship in York Schools Scrutiny Review

In June 2014 the Committee formed a Task Group to undertake a review aimed at improving entrepreneurship education in York schools. The Task Group considered best practice in other Local Authority areas and a number of national and European schemes designed to encourage enterprise in young people. They also reviewed current practices in York and met with representatives from York schools, NYBEP, and the Children's University and some of its business partners. In an effort to encourage York schools to undertake some form of entrepreneurial activity, the Task Group made a number of recommendations that could work in partnership with the projects that were already underway. They also welcomed the introduction of an Enterprise Governor at each York school and recommended the introduction of both an annual 'Tenner' challenge and a Young Entrepreneur Award as part of the annual Press Awards. The full Committee endorsed the Task Group's final report in March 2015 and this was approved by the Executive in June 2015.

- Narrowing the Gap Scrutiny Review

In November 2014 the Committee commenced a review of the attainment gap of York pupils recognising that the gap between disadvantaged young people and their peers in York was amongst the widest anywhere in the country. A Task Group was appointed and its members attended a conference in early December 2014 which brought together school representatives and partners to share information and examples of best practice, and focussed on what schools needed to do to further improve their efforts. The Task Group also visited a number of York schools to gauge the uptake of the best practice approach, and to gather information on the initiatives schools are implementing. In February 2015 the Task Group's recommendations were endorsed by the Committee and again the final report was approved by the Executive in June 2015.

14. Ad-hoc Scrutiny Reviews

In January 2015 CSMC agreed to a request from the Learning & Culture Overview & Scrutiny Committee to set up an Ad Hoc Scrutiny Committee to undertake a scrutiny review on ways to safeguard the long-term future of Yearsley Swimming Pool.

15. Work on this review is ongoing, and to date the Ad Hoc Scrutiny Committee has taken part in a site visit to Yearsley Pool, held a consultation meeting with pool users and interested parties and visited York City Baths Club to watch two swim squads in action. It has also considered information on the way community-led schemes from

elsewhere are funded. The review is expected to conclude in late summer 2015.

### **Supporting the Council Plan 2011-15**

16. All of the reviews carried out during 2014-15 (identified above) took account of the Council's need to be inclusive and ensure equality in accessing the services being reviewed. Each review also supported a number of the council's other improvement priorities and direction statements:
17. The following reviews were directly linked to the 'Protect Vulnerable People' element of the Council Plan 2011-15:
  - Equalities;
  - Yearsley Pool;
  - Supporting Older People;
  - A-Boards;
  - Disabled Access to York's Heritage and Cultural Offer;
  - Narrowing the Gap.
18. The following reviews were directly linked to the 'Build Strong Communities' element of the Council Plan 2011-15:
  - Equalities;
  - Yearsley Pool;
19. The following reviews were directly linked to the 'Create Jobs & Grow the Economy' element of the Council Plan 2011-15:
  - Online Business / E-Commerce Review.
  - Graduate Business Start-Ups, Entrepreneurialism and Higher Value Jobs Scrutiny Review
  - Entrepreneurship in York Schools
20. The Domestic Waste Recycling Review supported the 'Protect the Environment' element of the Council Plan 2011-15.

### **Finance & Performance Monitoring**

21. Throughout 2014-15 the Overview & Scrutiny Committees received regular quarterly monitoring reports relating to the council's performance and finance management, in service areas specific to their individual remits.

22. In addition, they also received other monitoring reports specific to their individual terms of reference, as detailed below:
23. Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee received updates / reports on:
  - The Workforce Strategy 2012-15;
  - The Annual Scrutiny Support Budget;
  - The Procurement Strategy;
  - Proposed changes to the terms of reference of two Scrutiny Committees;
  - The progress of the Single Equalities Scheme;
  - The Annual Overview & Scrutiny Report for 2013-14;
24. The Community Safety Overview & Scrutiny Committee received updates on:
  - The embedding of CYCs revised Taxi Licensing Policy;
  - The work of the Horse Bailiff;
  - The Refresh of the Single Equalities Scheme;
25. Throughout 2014-15, the Committee also received a number of updates in support of its responsibility for the discharge of the functions conferred on the Council by sections 19 & 20 of the Police & Justice Act 2006, in relation to the scrutiny of community safety issues, the Police and the work of the local Crime and Disorder Reduction Partnership (CDRP):
  - Bi-annual performance reports from Safer York Partnership (SYP);
  - A presentation from the Probation Service on delivery changes within the service;
  - Update on the work of AVANTE (Alcohol, Violence & Night-Time Economy);
  - A presentation from North Yorkshire Police on the new North Yorkshire Policing Model.
  - An update on the Anti-Social Behaviour Hub;
26. The Economic & City Development Overview & Scrutiny Committee received briefings/updates on:
  - Major developments within the city;
  - Major transport initiatives and issues arising from them;
  - York Economic Dashboard;
  - Update on the Refresh of the Single Equalities Scheme;
  - Low Emissions Strategy including an update of the Air Quality Action Plan;



- Bulk Buying of Energy;
- Update Report from YorCity Construction;
- Management of Regeneration projects in York;
- Universal Credit;
- Update on the economic implications of the Tour de France;
- Update on Newgate / Shambles market;
- Report on the Service Level Agreement for Make it York.

27. The Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee has a statutory role to review and scrutinise the impact of services and policies of key partners on the health of the city's population. As such it received updates on:

- York Health and Wellbeing Board;
- Safeguarding Arrangements;
- Carers' Strategy;
- Residential, Nursing and Home Care Services;
- Proposals for mental health services in York including improving child and adolescent mental health services and the future vision of mental health services across the city.
- Update of Refresh of the Single Equalities Scheme;
- Implications of Deprivation of Liberties Safeguards;
- Lunchtime meal arrangements for sheltered housing residents;
- Castlegate Centre;
- Re-procurement of Musculoskeletal Services;
- Personal Medical Services;
- Elderly People's Homes programme.

28. The Committee were also consulted on a number of issues:

- CCG five-year strategy for integrated health care in York
- Interim plans for Bootham Park Hospital;
- Monitor Investigation into York Teaching Hospital;
- Challenges faced by York Hospital over the Christmas and New Year period;
- Outcome of the Leeds and York Partnership Foundation Trust Care Quality Commission inspection;
- the merger of a number of medical practices in York – York Medical Group and Clifton; Gillygate and Jorvik; Haxby and Gale Farm.

29. Finally, they received a number of reports and presentations i.e.:

- Presentation by the CYC Head of Transformation about the work around Adult Social Care;

- Be Independent presentation about the development of the Community Interest Company and how it provides community equipment loan and telecare services;
- Healthwatch presentation into Discrimination Against Disabled People;
- Presentation by the Care Quality Commission on the new inspection process;
- Presentation by Health Education Yorkshire and the Humber on nurse training and workforce planning;
- Annual report of the Chief Executive of Yorkshire Ambulance Service;
- Annual report of the Chief Executive of York Teaching Hospital NHS Foundation Trust;
- Annual report of the Chief Executive of Leeds and York Partnership NHS Foundation Trust.

30. The Learning & Culture Overview & Scrutiny Committee received:

- York Museums Trust Bi-annual Partnership Delivery Plan Updates;
- York Theatre Royal Bi-annual Service Level Agreement Performance Updates;
- The first bi-annual update on Explore York Libraries and Archives Service Level Agreement;
- Bi-annual Progress Reports on Safeguarding and Looked After Children;
- CYC Stonewall Challenge (Anti-Bullying Strategy Group);
- Update on the Refresh of the Single Equalities Scheme;
- Update on Parks Development;
- School improvement and Ofsted update report;
- School Results outturn.

31. In addition the Committee received presentations from the Chair of York @ Large on the ongoing work of York @ Large; the Chair of Learning City York Partnership and the Chair of York Safeguarding Board.

### **Acting as Critical Friend**

32. During the municipal year 2014-15 each of the Overview & Scrutiny Committees met with the relevant Cabinet Members to hear about their challenges and priorities for the year. They also met with some of the council's appropriate statutory partners to hear about their priorities and challenges.

## **Monitoring Previous Recommendations**

33. Finally, each of the committees received bi-annual updates on the implementation of the approved recommendations arising from their previously completed scrutiny reviews. Those deemed to be fully completed were signed off.

## **Calling - In**

34. Throughout the municipal year 2014-15 there were nine Cabinet/ Cabinet Member decisions called-in for consideration by CSMC. The decision of the Cabinet was upheld in six instances. Those upheld were:
- Improving York's City Centre - Reinvigorate York Public Realm Improvement Projects: Exhibition Square/Theatre Interchange project;
  - Lendal Bridge and Coppergate Traffic Regulation Orders;
  - Community Stadium and Leisure Facilities Update;
  - York Guildhall and Riverside creating a Digital Media and Arts Centre;
  - City of York Local Plan Publication Draft.
  - The Council's Housing for Older People Programme.
35. Three other call-ins were referred back for further consideration. These were:
- Rewiring of Public Services: Business Case for Children's Services in relation to the Castlegate service;
  - Jockey Lane Pedestrian and Cycle Improvement Scheme;
  - A Congestion Committee for York;

## **Implications**

36. There are no known legal, HR and financial implications associated with the recommendation within this report.

## **Risk Management**

37. There are no known risks associated with the recommendation in this report.

## Recommendations

38. Having considered the information within this report, Members are asked to approve this Annual Scrutiny Report which covers the period between June 2014 and May 2015.

Reason: To enable its presentation to Full Council in July 2015, in line with Constitutional requirements.

## Contact Details

### Author:

Steve Entwistle  
Scrutiny Officer  
Tel: 01904 554279

### Chief Officer Responsible for the report:

Andrew Docherty  
Assistant Director Governance & ICT

Melanie Carr  
Scrutiny Officer  
Tel: 01904 552054

**Report Approved**



**Date:** 17 April 2015

**Specialist Implications Officer(s)** - None

### Wards Affected:

**All**



For further information please contact the authors of the report

**Background Papers:** None

**Annexes:** None

### Abbreviations:

AVANTE - Alcohol, Violence & Night-Time Economy

CSMC – Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee

CCG – Clinical Commissioning Group

CDRP - Crime and Disorder Reduction Partnership

CYC – City of York Council

ECDOSC – Economic & Development Overview & Scrutiny Committee

NHS – National Health Service

NYBEP – North Yorkshire Business Enterprise Partnership

SYP – Safer York Partnership